

NEON Working Group

Addressing Differential Outcomes for BME Learners meeting

Thursday 11th June 2020

Chat Feature

- 14:08:56 From Carol kilgannon : Hi All, Carol from Winchester.
- 14:09:13 From Beth Hope : Hi all, Beth from NSSW
- 14:11:18 From Maryam Shahpasand : Hi All, Maryam from Staffordshire University
- 14:13:00 From Maria-Anna NEON : If you have any questions for Gurnam, please write them here. Thank you
- 14:13:54 From Lindy-Ann Blaize Alfred : In the uK, please contextualise it
- 14:22:07 From Clare Ridley : This also links to students becoming global citizens, able to address environment crisis too
- 14:23:05 From Lindy-Ann Blaize Alfred : Would you say that the same holds for recruitment and progression - if staff don't hold the core competencies around challenging colonialism and racial literacy and competence - then they should not be promoted?
- 14:24:35 From Lindy-Ann Blaize Alfred : thank you, I love that you're such an optimist
- 14:24:35 From George Gisborne : Thank you Gurnam!
- 14:24:35 From Laura da Costa, Leeds Arts University : This is something that more forward thinking employers are beginning to consider in terms of promotion - to what extent middle managers for example, work to improve not only the diversity of their teams but equitable work allocation, inclusivity, etc
- 14:24:35 From Mia Thornton : Great words thanks Gurnam!
- 14:24:35 From Laura da Costa, Leeds Arts University : Wonderful, thank you Gurnam
- 14:24:37 From Stacey Fox : Fantastic talk - thank you!
- 14:24:53 From Clare Ridley : Thanks Gurnam, catalyst for becoming generation of liberators!
- 14:25:06 From Sarah C : Great considerations raised! We are having a lot of similar discussions at Winchester
- 14:25:23 From Heidi : As somebody working in widening access, the fact the gap is wider is something we need to tackle! Thanks Gurnam
- 14:26:31 From Lindy-Ann Blaize Alfred : Woo hoo...

14:26:42 From Maryam Shahpasand : Thanks Gurnam

14:28:14 From Sarah C : For those who haven't seen there was a really interesting piece on WONKHE this week about universities responses to the BLM and the murder of George Floyd via social media. https://wonkhe.com/blogs/we-cant-separate-the-issues-of-race-and-reopening-in-universities/?utm_medium=email&utm_campaign=Wonkhe%20Mondays%20-%208%20June&utm_content=Wonkhe%20Mondays%20-%208%20June+CID_a298f34fbf571ae973672ef7be83ab2b&utm_source=Email%20marketing%20software&utm_term=reflects%20on%20social%20media%20conversations%20about%20race%20and%20racism%20across%20higher%20education%20following%20the%20killing%20of%20George%20Floyd

14:28:51 From deborahhusbands : Thanks Sarah!

14:29:07 From Chere Reade-Edwards : Thank you Sarah

14:30:29 From Andrew Gray : Thanks for the link Sarah

14:42:39 From George Gisborne : Is slide 12 specific to BAME staff?

14:43:08 From Maria-Anna NEON : Please let us know of any questions for Graciano

14:43:12 From Maria-Anna NEON : Thank you

14:43:39 From Heidi : I like the idea of 24 hour helpline and published accounts of how staff are coping. I echo the same question re is this specific to BAME staff?

14:47:23 From Heidi : General comment - if anyone's interested there is a great poem called Hollow by Vanessa Kisuule about the fall of Colston's statue. <https://www.bristol247.com/news-and-features/news/bristols-city-poet-bids-farewell-to-eddie-colston/>

14:47:27 From Clare Ridley : What thoughts or examples do you have about help to academics to build a new inclusive culture, in the VLE?

14:53:52 From Laura da Costa, Leeds Arts University : There is some literature that assesses the impact of such activity, called 'perspective taking' (CIPD, 2019) report, as opposed to just unconscious bias training: perspective taking via sharing experiences has a greater impact on behavioural and attitudinal change

14:56:20 From graciano.brighton@gmail.com : Agree Steve - I'd suggest risk assess it and press ahead, not retract to the risks, but put in place a plan to respond to possible adverse responses from people who may object to the open discussion about race. Talking about race is key to change.

14:57:13 From Steve Hunter : Thanks Graciano

14:57:18 From Gurnam Singh : Unconscious bias is often a product of what Hannah Arendt terms 'mindlessness'. What we need is to become 'mindful' of our vulnerabilities to bias and then build our work around this. This means focussing on structural interventions and not just relying on our good will.

14:58:30 From Gurnam Singh : Thanks to Graciano for a thought provoking presentation.

14:59:52 From Sarah C : agreed Joanna part of the issue is the rhetoric over what constitutes student success and not recognising student success beyond just a 1st or 2;1

15:00:20 From Gurnam Singh : Is the language of 'good' and by contrast 'bad' degree or '1st, 2nd, 3rd 'class' part of the problem. Doesn't this play into labels and reductive notions of learning.

15:02:56 From Gurnam Singh : We know that a student with a 1st in PPE from Oxford is not any more 'intelligent' than anybody else. For sure they may have exceptional ability, but it is more likely that they have had massive structural benefits and interventional in their lives to achieve that exam success, which then provides them legitimacy for joining the elite. This is a vicious cycle that needs disruption, otherwise we will simply continue to reproduce privilege and power.

15:04:31 From Maria-Anna NEON : Please let us know of any questions for Joanna

15:05:07 From Gurnam Singh : The challenge is how can we develop new models of assessment and recognition of student learning, ability and potential to contribute to a society that values certain capabilities, such as ability to empower others, confront injustice, empower others, facilitate equity, creativity, humanity etc.

15:07:05 From George Gisborne : Are there any examples of positive outcomes in reducing the BAME awarding gap?

15:08:35 From Clare Ridley : How do you see partnerships with businesses helping? It strikes me that the business is also let down by grades not reflecting capability?

15:08:43 From Lindy-Ann Blaize Alfred : Yes, that's where the Value added score can make a difference.

15:09:23 From Lindy-Ann Blaize Alfred : However we define 'good degree' is only relative in the sense of understanding what students are learning BECAUSE of us - not in spite of us!

15:09:46 From graciano.brighton@gmail.com : Agreed, Gurnam - "This is a vicious cycle that needs disruption, otherwise we will simply continue to reproduce privilege and power" - I like the need to disrupt the flow of what's not working for society.

15:10:57 From Clare Ridley : I'm just trying to think about how this fundamental change in model that Gurnam spoke of can actually be realised....It's not as easy as toppling a statue in the river...

15:11:03 From Sarah C : Fantastic approach - the culture we want needs challenging not putting a plaster on it and using deficit approach of quick-fix 'targeted initiatives

15:11:12 From Sarah C : (what)

15:11:30 From Mary Makinde : How are various universities supporting students on health placements

15:12:25 From Mary Makinde : *students on health placements

15:12:43 From Deborah Husbands : Very problematic and contested terminology in this area

15:12:59 From Heidi : Yes I had a similar question in mind Karen - ie what more can I do to be a better ally, both personally and professionally.

15:13:30 From Joanna MacDonnell : Yes, agree Deborah - I include a terminology discussion in the workshops I lead.

15:14:05 From Joanna MacDonnell : Heidi Have you seen the Being a good Ally guidance on the BAMEed Network's resouces?

15:14:23 From Heidi : I'd like to hear more about the terminology discussion, Joanna! Thanks for the recommendation above.

15:14:38 From deborahhusbands : @Joanna please post link

15:14:43 From George Gisborne : So we need OfS to stop using race as a metric and focus on socio-economic background?

15:14:55 From Joanna MacDonnell : https://www.bameednetwork.com/wp-content/uploads/2019/07/advice-5c-20for_38970569.pdf

15:15:05 From Lindy-Ann Blaize Alfred : Consider the notion of meritocracy in terms of placing some of this debate as well

15:15:09 From Sarah C : How can we challenge some of this language that is embedded within our regulatory strutures e.g. 'good/bad degree', terms such as 'BAME etc.?

15:15:34 From Heidi : Thanks for the link

15:15:35 From Sarah C : and 'attainment gap' not 'awarding gap'

15:15:45 From Lindy-Ann Blaize Alfred : Really good resource that was curated by my colleague Muna Abdi

15:15:50 From Steve Hunter : Engaging community and industry more in curriculum design is needed to develop understanding and move away from classification bias

15:17:51 From Lindy-Ann Blaize Alfred : Challenge by just asking questions. Sarah C. Within one week of coming into the role of working around staff development in this area - I gave a very clear explanation of why I was not using the attainment gap language; and the language changed.

15:17:57 From deborahhusbands : These conversations are important, but how can we 'shift' the terminology territory into something more positive and useful beyond 'conversations'?

15:18:17 From Lindy-Ann Blaize Alfred : Yes Deborah, talk is incredibly cheap

15:19:16 From Lindy-Ann Blaize Alfred : Stop using the term 'challenging conversations about race' and impress upon staff that an entire profile of students are not being their best and authentic selves because of what WE [as an institution] are doing

15:19:31 From Lorraine Ballintine : I personally find it easier to talk to students than staff about race. As we get older we tend to get more rigid with our mindsets

15:20:04 From deborahhusbands : Very true Lindy-Ann

15:20:17 From Clare Ridley : I agree Steven. Linkage of Community and the workplace to create a shared new language and perspective of what is the value and role of education

15:20:35 From Lindy-Ann Blaize Alfred : Well, to use Gurnam's metric - we should have younger people teaching and the rigid mindsets go into Bristol Harbour. Seriously though, I don't think its fair.

15:21:09 From Lindy-Ann Blaize Alfred : I didn't know what BAME 8 years ago....

15:22:13 From Laura da Costa, Leeds Arts University : Surely how we grade/mark students' assignments/essays/creative outputs affects these degree awarding gaps - so do we need to be looking into how we define 'talent' in HE?

15:24:15 From Steve Hunter : That's an interesting issue Laura and would need benchmarks addressed in the first instance? We could start by looking at how we write learning outcomes. I think?

15:25:05 From Lindy-Ann Blaize Alfred : definitely Steve... good point

15:25:23 From Heidi : Thanks for sharing this diagram...

15:25:45 From Laura da Costa, Leeds Arts University : you're on mute karen

15:25:55 From Lindy-Ann Blaize Alfred : YES!! Critical self reflection is the starting point....

15:26:10 From Andrew Gray : Very helpful diagram thank you Gurnam

15:26:17 From Clare Ridley : Thx for ths diagram

15:27:50 From Heidi : On a personal basis, I spend a lot of my non-work time challenging people's views at the moment...!

15:27:52 From Clare Ridley : I found this short clip very thought provoking
<https://www.facebook.com/12567015515/posts/10158267619405516/?vh=e>

15:27:57 From Steve Hunter : I thought that figure was very useful to promote thought and reflection. I think often people pay lip service to issues. When if they felt able / more comfortable they could make a difference

15:29:05 From Lindy-Ann Blaize Alfred : @Clare - I really dislike this video

15:29:59 From George Gisborne : @Lindy-Anne why?

15:30:09 From Carol kilgannon : who runs that Ally training please?

15:30:15 From Alice Chowen : do you have any suggestions of external providers that provide ally training

15:30:42 From Lindy-Ann Blaize Alfred : Imagine if you're one of the people at the back of the line? what does it serve you to be shown this example of a live you know you're living? what does it teach the people at the front?

15:31:01 From Lindy-Ann Blaize Alfred : How does this example NO reproduce privilege however well intentioned.

15:31:33 From George Gisborne : @Lindy-Ann thanks

15:31:43 From Alice Chowen : that would be great thank you

15:31:48 From Lindy-Ann Blaize Alfred : Based on some development I had with AHE I developed an alternative to this using as well Yosso's notion of cultural capital and i'm happy to share with you

15:31:58 From George Gisborne : Yes please

15:32:12 From deborahhusbands : This is definitely a matter of perspective-taking. Some people will see this as powerful. What we don't know is how those young people were subsequently able to have a wider discussion about the outcome

15:32:22 From Clare Ridley : @lindy-Ann thank you

15:32:43 From Laura da Costa, Leeds Arts University : @Joanna Do you evaluate the training? I've been in some sessions where I'm sure some people have left feeling like they now understand whereas any BAME people in the room would not feel the same...

15:33:14 From Joanna MacDonnell : Yes, the E&D team evaluate the training.

15:33:23 From deborahhusbands : We're doing this at Westminster - reverse mentoring

15:33:30 From deborahhusbands : I dislike the term though

15:33:31 From Laura da Costa, Leeds Arts University : There is evidence on reverse mentoring that indicates it is encouraging, including at increasing buy in at senior levels

15:33:42 From Lindy-Ann Blaize Alfred : you're welcome

15:33:44 From Sarah C : We do student shadowing for senior managers and try to include students from diverse backgrounds for this

15:33:59 From Heidi : Love the reverse mentoring idea! Understand concerns about the term....

15:34:24 From Joanna MacDonnell : That's a helpful suggestion Sarah,

15:34:31 From Joanna MacDonnell : Thank you

15:34:42 From Sarah C : I also struggle with unconscious bias - either way it's bias and by labelling it 'unconscious' are we excusing it?

15:35:15 From deborahhusbands : Please ensure students are paid for their time when sharing valuable insight into their living experiences

15:35:17 From Steve Hunter : I think the mentoring idea is excellent. Observation and (reported) understanding is one thing. Learning about feelings and experreinces is another level

15:35:57 From Laura da Costa, Leeds Arts University : @joanna, do you also do training with students?

15:36:09 From Lindy-Ann Blaize Alfred : I'm going to be the 'Debbie downer' here and say that reverse mentoring is great if the student who is doing the mentoring has the agency and the 'woke' ness to really make a difference. I just wonder the extent to which internalised racism may be guiding the student mentor...and how that would reify these power dynamics...

15:36:26 From Lindy-Ann Blaize Alfred : yes @Laura...development would be key I think

15:37:12 From deborahhusbands : @Lindy-Ann it's a process that needs careful panning, briefing and de-briefing on both sides

15:37:13 From Gurnam Singh : Good words of caution from Lindy-Ann

15:37:21 From deborahhusbands : *planning

15:39:05 From Lindy-Ann Blaize Alfred : @deborah - understood.

15:39:09 From Steve Hunter : I agree, careful training and planning would be fundamental to this as any mentoring programme

15:39:51 From Lindy-Ann Blaize Alfred : Yes, i'd advocate for a Missing 300 [professor] pipeline

15:40:28 From deborahhusbands : ...and we could end up with the parachuted professor becoming the sacrificial lamb

15:41:01 From Lindy-Ann Blaize Alfred : and tokenistic...

15:41:11 From Steve Hunter : We use our students to support other students at the levels below. The aim to facilitate progression through support. This is for all students but of there are shared issues.

15:43:22 From Lindy-Ann Blaize Alfred : Just a plug for my former colleague who produced the allyship document that was shared - @Muna_Abdi_PhD is her twitter handle and she does development sessions in this area for staff

15:43:54 From deborahhusbands : Agreed - she's excellent! A real agitator!

15:44:12 From Seetal Jassal : festivalofdebate.com/events/decolonising-the-curriculum-from-abc-to-phd Sharing this link to anyone interested in exploring this issue further

15:44:20 From Joanna MacDonnell : Muna Abdi's Twitter is great - well worth a follow, good to know she does development sessions too.

15:44:39 From Sarah C : great session thanks all

15:44:43 From Owen Beacock : Yes Graciano - move away from sector benchmarking and focus on your own institution.

15:44:58 From Kiran Sandhu : Thank you for a great session!

15:45:34 From Maryam Shahpasand : Great session and Thanks

15:45:34 From Alice Chowen : Thank you, this was great

15:45:44 From Gurnam Singh : Great summary by Karen

15:45:49 From Joanna MacDonnell : Thank you everyone, it's been a great afternoon.

15:45:54 From Lindy-Ann Blaize Alfred : Thank you Karen

15:46:00 From Maria-Anna NEON : Thank you everyone

15:46:04 From Melinda Finn : Thank you, it's been interesting

15:46:04 From Lindy-Ann Blaize Alfred : Gurnam and others - see you soon

15:46:10 From Mary Makinde : Thank you everyone

15:46:13 From Lorraine Ballintine : Thanks Karen

15:46:19 From Steve Hunter : Thanks to Karen the speakers and everyone else.

15:46:20 From deborahhusbands : Thank you NEON team!

15:46:42 From Lindy-Ann Blaize Alfred : Excellent. thanks

15:47:03 From Jo Ellmore : Thank you!

15:47:05 From deborahhusbands : Oh yes - the list is long!!!

15:47:23 From Stu Butler : Thanks so much!

15:47:32 From Seetal Jassal : Fantastic panel discussion - thank yu